

1/515012/2024

Minutes of the pre-publication meeting related to the tender titled “Cell broadcast based Integrated Public Alert and Warning System Alert and Warning System for Assam State Disaster Management Authority held on 20.03.2024 at ASDMA Conference Hall, Dispur”

The List of Members present in the meeting as at Annexure –I.

The pre-publication meeting on the activity titled “Cell broadcast based Integrated Public Alert and Warning System for ASDMA ” was held on 20.03.2024 under the chairmanship of Shri G.D. Tripathi, IAS, Principal Secy. to the Govt. of Assam (Rev. & DM Dept.) and Chief Executive officer, ASDMA. At the outset, Chairperson of the Committee welcomed the members joining online as well as offline while providing the opening remarks on the proposed objective of the meeting. The meeting was also attended by representatives from PIU under AIRBMP, PMTC under FREMAA, appointed adjudicator for the activity Cell broadcast and other representatives.

In his initial remark CEO,ASDMA clearly specified that the objective of the Cell broadcasting solution under the AIRBMP is to disseminate severe disaster alerts to the cell phone subscribers within the state of Assam for addressing better disaster preparedness. Thereafter, the Chairperson directed Member Convenor to initiate the proceedings of the meeting.

Moreover, before commencement of the discussions on the tender, ASDMA also intimated the participants on the disclaimer that the incorporation of the feedbacks/suggestions if any received for the tender by ASDMA will be based on the feasibility of project’s unique functional requirement.

Accordingly, Member under component EWDS, PIU, AIRBMP, ASDMA provided a brief ppt presentation on the nitty gritty of the tender activity of Cell broadcast to the member representatives of the various firms.

After detailed discussion and careful considerations of the suggestions/feedback raised by representatives of the various firms, CEO, ASDMA requested the participants to submit suggestions/feedback related to the activity of Cell broadcast over email till 1700 hrs on 22.03.2024 so as to enable ASDMA to prepare a generic and optimised tender document for availing the highest standards of services under the activity Cell broadcast.

The queries received from the various participating OEMs/SIs/TSPs till 1700 hrs on 22.03.2024 alongwith the relevant responses of ASDMA have been placed at **Annexure –II.**

The meeting ended with vote of thanks from the Chair.

(G.D. Tripathi, IAS)
Principal Secy. to the Govt. of Assam
(Rev. & DM Dept)
Cum
Chief Executive Officer,ASDMA
Assam, Dispur.

Annexure-I

Attendance sheet for Pre-Republication Meeting on the Activity Cell Broadcasting Under Project AIRBMP of ASDMA Held on 20.03.2024 at ASDMA Conference Hall			
Sl. No	Name	Organisation and Designation	Mobile No. & Email Id
1	Shri Gyanendra Dev Tripathi, IAS	CEO, ASDMA	0361-2237221, asdmaghy@gmail.com
2	Neil Lobo	Utimaco	9769935940
3	Harsh MJS	Utimaco	9846014830
4	Sumit Kumar Jha	C-DOT	9746632476
5	Pramod Bhawe	C-DOT	9650109910
6	Harish Sandal	HSS Engineering AIS	9910034003
7	Vijay A.	Temflo Systems	9891777903
8	Arvind Joshi	Temflo Systems	9643611898
9	Surya Kotnala	Procurement Specialist, PMTC	7060033338
10	Dr Kazi Iqbal Hassan	Team Leader PMTC	7756270692
11	Kapil Dey	Procurement Officer AIRBMP	9435075754
12	Biren Baishya	GIS Expert, ASDMA	9435746436
13	Abhijnan Rajkhowa	Comm. Expert, ASDMA	9957415724
14	Mr. Anush Shetty	Intech Online Private Limited	8976880517
15	Mr. Prasad Naik	Intech Online Private Limited	8976880517
16	Siddhartha	Insight Brandcom Pvt Ltd.	
17	Goutam Banerji, CEO	ElectroMesh Pvt Ltd.	info@electromesh.in
18	Vijay Dubey	Kisters	
19	Saikat Ghosh	Representative, CMS Computers Ltd	
20	Prashant Shende	Representative, Utimaco	
21	M K Gogoi	AIRBMP, SDMA, Adjudicator	
22	Anup	TCIL	
23	Srinjoy Banerjee	Representative, (nil)	

SL. No	Queries	ASDMA Response
1	The bidders having experience in EWDS (not necessarily cell broadcasting) should be eligible to bid.	No. change
2	The experience of consultancy and/or research & development (R&D) should also be considered.	No. change
3	The bidders should be permitted to utilize the experience of its OEM to qualify the experience criteria related to cell broadcasting.	This critical Disaster Management (DM) project encompasses various vital components: an experienced O&M support service provider, a Cloud Service Provider (CSP), primary and secondary MPLS/ILL links from different ISPs, at least two TSPs for disseminating geolocated alerts, and a reputable CB OEM for deployment. It's imperative that a bidder meets each of these qualification criteria for CB deployment, rather than relying solely on the OEM's qualifications without deploying their CB. The project's complexity demands a well-organized O&M structure with efficient backend support for timely issue resolution across multiple fronts, including RAN-CB Interface and CBE-CBC Interface, on a live system.
4	The bidder's tie up with its OEM in the form of "consortium" and "sub-contracting" should also be permitted in addition to "JV"	The Consortium or Joint Venture (JV) doesn't carry the same weight as a subcontractor. For instance, if a Bidder lacks qualification for specific criteria and prefers not to share liabilities through a Consortium or JV, they may opt for a subcontractor. However, the subcontractor's experience is merely used to meet requirements and isn't party to the contract with ASDMA. Additionally, the lead Bidder might not even utilize the service for which the subcontractor's experience was utilized. It's advisable to maintain flexibility in selection criteria within defined boundaries to mitigate the risk of non-performers undermining the buyer's end objective.
5	Instead of CDOT-compliant CAP, requested to incorporate ITU-compliant CAP.	Regarding the CAP standards, it's essential to implement the Common Alerting Protocol Version 1.2 as defined by OASIS and adopted as Recommendation X.1303 by ITU-T.
6	Make in India/indigenously developed solutions to be preferred for product offerings by Vendors.	Being a World Bank (WB), funded project, all OEM products shall have equal weightage in this tender.
7	Justification of integration with 04 TSPs in eligibility criteria instead of 02 TSPs.	The subject turnkey project will be awarded to the successful bidder, who will serve as our sole point of contact throughout the project duration. Therefore, the contractor will be accountable to us for ensuring key criteria such as SLA/Uptime, backend connectivity, cloud hosting, and integration with Telecom Service Providers (TSPs). As the state of Assam has only four TSPs, requiring integration with all of them could potentially diminish the competitiveness of the tender, allowing TSPs to wield monopoly and collusion tactics with the contractor. Alternatively, by stipulating integration with any two TSPs initially, the contractor gains the flexibility to negotiate and secure the best rates for third-party services. Subsequently, under the same terms and conditions, SDMA can request integration with the remaining two TSPs as needed.

8	Consideration of Startups (firms) under Eligibility criteria.	The subject project is dealing with the "Public safety" for the State of Assam. Proven credentials in both CB deployment and Operations and Maintenance (O&M) are crucial for a reliable "DISASTER GRADE CB ALERT" solution. Without it, the purpose of implementing a state-of-the-art system would be compromised. Furthermore, since this initiative is funded by the World Bank (WB), all bidders hold equal importance in the tender process.
9	The offered solution is to be entirely available on a disaster-graded service mode.	The proposed Cell Broadcast (CB) project shall be characterized by its reliability, security, scalability, and ability to reach the people of Assam rapidly. These disaster-resilient characteristics shall be tailored suitably as part of our technical specifications and functional requirements of the project, with stringent penalties, if the SLAs are not met.
10	Consider the inclusion of Siren also alongwith CB tender	Cell Broadcast is the most ubiquitous alert dissemination technology available today. Hence, ASDMA seeks a robust and targeted disaster alert system through its Cell Broadcast (CB) project. More importantly, for a difficult terrain state like Assam, it is not practically/technically/commercially feasible for Sirens to cover the entire State! Moreover, while the burden of siren maintenance rests solely on ASDMA, the backend upkeep of CB is guaranteed by TSPs and IPs. Nevertheless, upcoming disaster management projects may incorporate additional dissemination methods.
11	With regards to the 'Basic Experience' criteria, we would like to request that the below mentioned statement be paraphrased with the inclusion of the word 'Cell Broadcast based'	Noted; The line be read as, "The Bidder should have experience in the successful execution of Cell Broadcast based projects, which have been completed or substantially completed within the last 7 years prior to the deadline for submission of bids"
12	With regards to the 'Basic Experience' criteria, would request, that for added for clarity, that the word 'commercially' may be included in both the statements	Noted; The sole bidder or any JV member (in the case of a JV) must have experience in commercially proven (live) implementing at least 'ONE' Location-based Cell Broadcast system.
13	Given that the Cell Broadcast technology is a powerful means to communicate with millions within a few seconds without the need for mobile numbers, it is important that the proposed bidder provides not just a solution that meets the defined SLAs, but also a secure solution so as to avoid misuse by rogue elements. You may want this to be included in the tender document.	Noted.

14	<p>Under the 'Technical Presentation' criteria, we would like to request that the word 'CDoT' be struck off from the said statement. CAP is not a proprietary protocol of any entity/vendor, but a standards-based interface protocol. ASDMA may want to consider the following suggestion</p>	<p>The CAP compliance requirement for our CB project shall ensure interoperability and consistency across all disaster alerting systems and devices, allowing for seamless dissemination of emergency information to the public. Hence, the offered CB System (CBS) shall be compliant with global standards (3GPP/ETSI/ATIS), and the Cell Broadcast Centre (CBC) should integrate with Sachet CBE developed and deployed by CDoT. The CBC should be able to initiate an alert by itself and it should also have the capability of integrating with multiple CBEs over the API/CAP interface. Henceforward, the offered CBS shall be based on</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) 3GPP TS 23.041 (Technical Realisation of CBS) and b) 3GPP TS 44.012 (SMS-CB) standards alongwith its subsequent releases/updates) c) Indian Standards and integration requirements, as updated and promulgated by the Ministry of Communications/GOI and TRAI.
15	<p>With regards to the payment terms, we would request if Option 1 could be considered</p>	<p>Noted.</p>
16	<p>Both eligibility criteria do not support any Indian company. In India, only one State (Andhra Pradesh) has a Cell Broadcast facility which was procured from a foreign company registered in India. According to your requirement, it looks like ASDMA has already made up its mind to go with a foreign EOM only. We request you accommodate Indian companies and OEM to give a change before inviting foreign OEMs? In my opinion, ASDMA should go with a proof of concept with both Indian and foreign OEMs and then choose the appropriate technology and services. That will save millions of rupees and also support the country's vision of promoting indigenous technology and solutions.</p>	<p>A responsible Government is always committed to its public and citizens not only for legislation, policy, and capacity building, but also towards the prevention of disasters, mitigation, response, and long-term rehabilitation of the affected. With disaster events on the rise, exacerbated by climate change, the need for effective Disaster Management (DM) solutions is more pressing than ever. Therefore, the proposed Cell Broadcast (CB) system must have a proven track record and a solid reputation, preferably with state-level implementation in India or internationally. In short, the objective of this national Tender is to get the best solution at the most cost-effective price point, irrespective of the origins of the Bidder. It is in ASDMA's interest as well to have experienced Bidders, domestic or international, given the intricacies of this technology.</p>
17	<p>Cell Broadcast (CB) solution whether Indian or global should meet requirements as per DOT OM on "Technical requirements of Cell Broadcast Services to disseminate alerts during disasters" attached herewith for reference.</p>	<p>For the information of all participants, our views on each of those points mentioned in the DoT Office Memo (OM) are opined against each from serial 18 to 22 below.</p>
18	<p>Time to disseminate messages through cell broadcast (CB) will be a maximum of 10 Seconds. The dissemination time will be measured from the moment the alert is sent by CAP to the time it is received by the first mobile device in the target area.</p>	<p>The ASDMA project aims to minimize time delays even further.</p>

19	CB support system to have a service availability of 99.999% from the Cell Broadcast Entity (CSE) to the TSP Network.	Noted; The functional specifications shall be revised accordingly.
20	The CB Alert System to have the capability to disseminate alerts to up to 4 large adjoining LSAs with a single alert message from CAP.	While technically feasible and suitable for a national-scale project, implementing a License Service Area (LSA) for disseminating to four large adjoining LSAs may not be feasible or commercially viable for a small state like Assam. Moreover, if the objective is to disseminate to LSAs neighbouring Assam, the resource requirements would need to be carefully assessed, leading to a significant increase in overall project costs.
21	The CB Alert System to incorporate security measures, including data integrity and protection.	Do; Cell Broadcast Service (CBS), in its simplest implementation consists of one Cell Broadcast Centre (CBC), which is typically located in the network of a mobile operator, and at least one Cell Broadcast Entity (CBE) (the messaging interface to the CBC). ASDMA being a trusted government authority, shall include multi-level security controls, and institutionalised checks and balances prior to the final press of the "Go" button.
22	Extract of Government of India, Ministry of Communications, Department of Telecom, Office Memorandum dated 22 September 2023, on the minimum Technical requirements of Cell Broadcast Services to disseminate alerts during disasters.	Kindly note that these technical specifications are interim in nature. The Telecommunication Engineering Centre (TEC) will develop comprehensive standards for the Nation Platform for CB Alert within the next few months. It will be binding for all Telecom Service Providers (TSPs) to ensure that their CB solutions, facilitated in collaboration with their respective CB implementation partners, adhere to the specified technical requirements mentioned above until the TEC finalizes these standards.
23	Along with 2G, 3G and 4G the CB solution should be 5G ready and 5G Cell Broadcasting should have been demonstrated in Indian jurisdiction.	Ability to integrate network controllers for 2G, 3G, 4G, 5G and future technologies along with respective live cell sites, shall be part of our minimal functional requirements of this project.
24	CBC should have already been deployed in at least 2 Telcom Operators(Reliance Jio, BSNL, Bharti Airtel, or Vi) network and covering more than 40% telecom cell towers in the State of Assam.	How to quantify or measure 40%, especially when multiple operators share cell towers? For more, kindly refer to Serial 7 above.
25	The CBE should be CAP (ITU-T x.1303) complaint and capable to trigger all TSPs(Reliance Jio, BSNL, Bharti Airtel, and Vi) from a unified platform for targeted disaster alert dissemination through cell broadcasting to the public.	Point already clarified at serials 5 and 14 above.

26	<p>The clause mentioned in the presented PPT reproduced as "The Cell Broadcast (OEM) solution proposed for this contract must have a presence in the global market for at least 10 years from the date of submission of the bid" is a restrictive clause thus C-DOT suggests "The OEM solution should have proven credentials of deployment in mobile network of India".</p>	<p>Point already clarified in serials 6, 8, 11 and 16 above.</p>
27	<p>The offered solution should have future migration path plan to NDMA CAP Sachet platform.</p>	<p>Agreed; The offered CBS shall also integrate with the upcoming CAP compliant National Cell Broadcast Platform, in future, via its southbound and northbound interfaces. Being a standard driven project (as indicated at serials 5 and 14 above), this shall not be an issue - going forward.</p>
28	<p>A minimum lock-in period of 2 years for the offered solution should be included in the bid document.</p>	<p>Already indicated by CEO, ASDMA in his opening address</p>
29	<p>We understand that the payment terms will be based on no. of subscribers. This doesn't seem to be justified. A payment of a bidder investing lot of money in implementing the solution should not depend on no. of subscribers. If subscribers are less, the bidder will run into losses. It is therefore requested to make the payment terms on Capex basis. The quoted price should be paid in a fixed no. tranches irrespective of no. of subscribers.</p>	<p>We kindly request your attention to both Option-1 and Option-2 slides regarding "Payment Terms & Conditions." Neither option mentions "payment terms based on the number of subscribers," nor was such a discussion included in our subsequent conversations. Furthermore, considering that CB operates as a one-way broadcast, it's unclear how we would quantify the number of subscribers.</p>